LICTS
مؤتمر ليبيا الدولي لدراسات الترجمة
Libya's International Conference on Translation Studies

عدد خاص بمؤتمر ليبيا الدولى لدراسات الترجمه

01 اكتوبر 2022 إلى 07 اكتوبر 2022

# مجلة كلية اللغات

# Faculty of Languages Journal

مجلة علمية محكمة فصلية تصدر عن كلية اللغات جامعة طرابلس

**A Scientific Journal Issued by the Faculty of Languages, University of Tripoli, Libya**

**Special issue**
**April 2023**

رقم الإيداع 2015 /167 دار الكتب الوطنية بنغــازي

ISSN : 2790-4016

كلية اللغات
قسم الترجمة
جامعة طرابلس
LICTS
مؤتمر ليبيا الدولي لدراسات الترجمة
Libya's International Conference on Translation Studies
01 October 2022
طرابلس - ليبيا / فندق المهاري ( راديسون بلو )
محاور المؤتمر
• واقع الترجمة المهنية في ليبيا
• تعليم الترجمة وتدريب المترجمين
• ترجمة الأدب الليبي
• معايير تقييم الترجمات والمترجمين
• تقنيات الترجمة الحديثة
• الترجمة والتواصل الثقافي بين الشعوب
• حركة الترجمة في الفضاء الافتراضي
• الترجمة وحركة الاقتصاد العالمي
• دور الترجمة في العلاقات الدولية
• تحديات المترجمين في زمن الحروب
• الترجمة والهجرة
• الترجمة والأزمات الاقتصادية والسياسية والأمنية
الأهداف
● تشخيص واقع الترجمة الحالي في ليبيا ومقارنته بالتجارب الدولية بغية وضع استراتيجيات لإفادة الجامعات ومراكز التدريب من تلك التجارب في تدريس الترجمة وتدريب المترجمين واستخدام تقنيات الترجمة الحديثة وتطوير أفضل الممارسات وتطبيق أحدث المعايير.
● الاستفادة من التجربة الدولية وتبادل الخبرات الفردية وتقييم سوق العمل لتطوير البرامج التعليمية والتدريبية التي تلبي احتياجات السوق.
- آخر موعد لاستلام الملخصات 30 أغسطس 2022
licts.2022@gmail.com
تنظيم
RAKIZA
EVENTS ORGANIZER

الكلمة الافتتاحية

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

والصلاة والسلام على أشرف الأنبياء والمرسلين

تحية طبية وشكرا لكم على حضور مؤتمر ليبيا الدولي لدراسات الترجمة الذي تنظمه كلية اللغات بجامعة طرابلس وبالتعاون مع شركة ركيزة لتنظيم المؤتمرات.

بهذه الكلمة نفتتح هذا المؤتمر والذي رأينا أن يصادف يوم تحتفي به أقسام ومراكز الترجمة وهو اليوم العالمي للترجمة.

وهو يوم تحتفل به جُل المؤسسات والجامعات التي تعنى بعلم الترجمة في العالم، ويصدر الاتحاد الدولي للمترجمين شعار يميز كل سنة عن السنوات التي قبلها، وشعار سنة 2021 هو united in translation (الترجمة تجمعنا) وأتى هذا الشعار ليعبر عن التباعد الذي سببته الكورونا خلال العام الماضي، حيث قرر الاتحاد الدولي للمترجمين اختيار شعار يرمز إلى الاجتماع (فالترجمة تجمعنا). أما شعار هذه السنة هو A World without Barriers (عالم بدون حواجز).

في عام 2017، كان هناك إنجازًا تاريخيًا لجميع المترجمين، حيث اعتمدت الدورة 71 للجمعية العامة للأمم المتحدة بالإجماع القرار A/RES/71/288، الذي أقر بدور الترجمة المهنية في ربط الدول وتعزيز السلام والتفاهم والتطوير. في القرار نفسه، أعلنت الجمعية العامة للأمم المتحدة يوم 30 سبتمبر ليكون اليوم الدولي للترجمة للأمم المتحدة، ويتم الاحتفال به عبر شبكة الأمم المتحدة بأكملها.

فأرحب باسمي وباسم قسم الترجمة بكل المترجمين الذين هم معنا اليوم وأقول لهم الترجمة هي الماضي وهي المستقبل. الترجمة هي الناقلة التي تنقل الكلمات والعبارات والثقافات، الترجمة هي الرابط بين المجتمعات. الترجمة تفتح الأبواب لتعلم الثقافات،

الترجمة هي جسر للتواصل بين الشعوب، والمترجمون هم المهندسون والبُناة لهذه الجسور. الترجمة فكر وأدب وسياسية، الترجمة فن وأبداع، الترجمة علم ودراسة.

الترجمة تتشابك وتتلاقح مع كثير من المجالات، فقد أصبحت جزء لا يتجزأ من علوم تقنية المعلومات، فتجد المترجم على سبيل المثال في شركات التقنية والمستشفيات والمحاكم والملاعب وفي دور النشر والمحطات الإعلامية، فلو كنت تريد لعمل ماء أن يخرج للعالمية، فلا غنى عن المترجم.

بعدما كانت الترجمة فرع من فروع علم اللسانيات وكانت معظم أبحاث الترجمة في علوم اللغة المقارن، الآن هي علم مستقل بذاته، له مجالاته وفروعه. فمجالات الترجمة تشمل الترجمة التحريرية والترجمة الفورية والترجمة السمعية البصرية والترجمة الآلية والأدوات المساعدة التقنية

الآن هناك أقسام مستقلة بداتها تقوم بتدريس علوم الترجمة في كثير من بلدان العالم وكذلك في بلادنا العربية، يوجد في ليبيا أقسام مستقلة تجيز شهائد في الترجمة ولدينا برامج ماجستير في الترجمة وما هذه الفعاليات التي نشهدها من حين الآخر إلا دليل على حيوية أنشطة ودراسات الترجمة.

بل أن الترجمة ذهبت أكثر من ذلك وأصبحت تطرق أبواب تخصصات وعلوم أخرى لتتباحث معها بعض الظواهر، فدراسات الترجمة هو تخصص يتتداخل مع كل العلوم اللغوية والإعلامية والاجتماعية والأنثروبولوجيا والتاريخ والعلوم السياسية والدبلوماسية والطبية وغيرها.

سيكون لدينا اليوم 30 مداخلة باللغاتِ العربية والإنجليزية والفرنسية والإيطالية من مختلف الجامعات الليبية وبعض الجامعات العربية والدولية وستركز على جوانب مهمة في مجالات الترجمة، مها اطلالات على وضع الترجمة في ليبيا ومنها مناقشات علمية حول تدريس الترجمة ومنها مداخلات بحثية تناقش الترجمة الأدبية والإعلامية والترجمة الآلية وغيرها.

في الختام، أرحب بكم من جديد ونسأل الله لنا ولكم التوفيق والاستفادة من هذه المشاركات التي ستكون قيمة بعون الله.

**اللجنة العلمية للمؤتمر**

1. د. حمزة امحمد الثلب - رئيس اللجنة العلمية
2. د. جمال محمد جابر - عضو
3. د. محمد جمعة زاقود - عضو
4. د. الحسين سليم محسن - عضو
5. أ.د. نوري احمد عبيريد - عضو
6. د. خديجة مسعود فشيكة - عضو
7. أ.فاتح المبروك خليفة صمود- عضو

## الكلمـــة الختاميـة للمؤتمـر

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

تم بحمد الله ورعايته أعمالُ (مؤتمر ليبيا الدولي لدراسات الترجمة)، تحت شعار "الترجمة ومتطلبات القرن الواحد والعشرين: تحديات الواقع وآفاق المستقبل" الذي نظمته كلية اللغات بجامعة طرابلس، بالتعاون مع شركة ركيزة لتنظيم المؤتمرات، بتاريخ الأول من أكتوبر 2022 م بجامعة طرابلس، ليبيا.

وقد شارك في هذا المؤتمر 30 باحثا متخصصا في الترجمة، وباللغات العربية والإنجليزية والفرنسية والإيطالية، من ليبيا ومن 5 دول أخرى، وهي: المغرب وتركيا وماليزيا وإسبانيا والإمارات، وبحضور رئيس جامعة طرابلس وعدد من الوزراء وبعض عمداء الكليات، وشخصيات أكاديمية ومدراء مراكز بحثية.

وانعقد المؤتمر على مدار يوم واحد، نوقشت فيه أبحاث الأساتذة المشاركين،

والتي أسهمت في إثراء البحث العلمي المشترك بين الجامعات الليبية والعربية والمراكز البحثية المتخصصة في مجالات الترجمة، كما أسهم في الإفادة والاستفادة من كل التجارب لتطوير وتفعيل البرامج التدريسية والأكاديمية بين الجامعات الليبية وبعض التجارب الدولية.

هذا وتركزت الأبحاث في محاور عديدة منها: التواصل الفعال عن طريق الترجمة، ودور المترجم في التعامل مع النصوص السياسية والإعلامية، ومكانة المترجم في المجتمع الإنساني. وقد ناقشت بعض البحوث الترجمة الأدبية والترجمة الدينية والترجمة والأزمات. ولم يقتصر الأمر على ذلك، بل سلطت بعض المداخلات الضوء على الترجمة الشفهية والترجمة الآلية والترجمة السمعية البصرية، وتفضل بعض الأساتذة الكرام

بمناقشة صناعة الترجمة في ليبيا والبرامج التدريسية الخاصة بالترجمة في بعض الجامعات وغيرها من الكلمات في مجال الترجمة.

وقد انتهى المؤتمر إلى عدد من التوصيات، وأهمها ما يلي:

1. فتح باب التعاون بين الجامعات الليبية فيما يخص برامج الترجمة من أجل تطوير هذه البرامج وربطها بسوق العمل.
2. تكثيف البرامج التدريبية الخاصة بالترجمة لسد العجز في السوق الليبي وخاصة الترجمة الفورية.
3. إدخال برامج الترجمة الآلية والأدوات المساعدة في البرامج التدريسية.
4. العمل على تطوير وتقنين مهنة الترجمة في ليبيا والعمل على تأسيس نقابة عامة للمترجمين تكون مهمتها منح الإذن لمزاولي مهنة الترجمة.
5. التأكيد على تشجيع حركة الترجمة وذلك بجعل الأعمال المترجمة جزء من النتاج العلمي للأستاذ الجامعي المتخصص بالترجمة وتضمينه في الترقيات الأكاديمية وغيرها.
6. التأكيد على التعاون مع المنظمات الدولية وحث المترجمين الليبيين على عضويتها لتطوير حركة الترجمة بليبيا.
7. أن يكون مؤتمر الترجمة سنويا ،وينعقد في جامعة طرابلس أو اَي جامعة ليبية مستعدة لاستضافته

ولكم فائق الشكر.

والسلام عليكم ورحمة الله وبركاته.

حُرر في 1/10/ 2022 م، في مدينة طرابلس ـ ليبيا.

د. حمزة امحمد الثلب - رئيس اللجنة العلمية للمؤتمر

للتواصل مع مجلة كلية اللغات
مدير تحرير المجلة
د. فتحي سالم علي سالم
البريد الالكتروني
allogat@uot.edu.ly

# Analyzing Postgraduate Student Commentaries on Literary English/Arabic Translation

**Shagmani Abulgasem**

Department of Translation, The Libyan Academy, Tripoli, Libya

Abulshgamani@gmail.com

**ABSTRACT**

Writing a translation commentary is one of the tools for teaching and learning about translation. It can serve as an aid for evaluation, an activity for raising the consciousness of the students, or a basis for planning further instruction. Writing a translation commentary in English on an Arabic translation of an English literary text is the most challenging for Libyan postgraduate students, especially as they have learnt English as a foreign language. Having said that, making students to write translation commentaries in the classroom, a common practice proved to be a fruitful one, in this case. This paper is an exercise on analysing 15 translation commentaries of English to Arabic translation of one text. The source text for translation is a literary commentary on a poem titled: The Farmer's Bride by the English poet: Charlotte Mew, first published in 1916. The paper will also describe the Translation Commentary as a tool to be used by postgraduate students for research on translation and understanding the process of translating English literary texts into Arabic. The paper concludes that writing a translation commentary is an interactive process, which involves the understanding not only the content and the connotations of the ST but also the other aspects including linguistic, phonetic and figurative characteristics that make it a literary creation.

**الملخص**

تعد كتابة تعليق على الترجمة إحدى أدوات التدريس والتعلم حول الترجمة. ويمكن أن يكون التعليق أداة مساعدة لتقييم الطلاب، أو نشاط لرفع وعي الطلاب حول ترجمة النصوص من لغة إلى أخرى. ويمكن أن يستعمله الأستاذ أو المدرب كأساس للتحضير لمزيد من دروس الترجمة. تعد كتابة تعليق ترجمة باللغة الإنجليزية على ترجمة عربية لنص أدبي

إنجليزي هو التحدي الأكبر بالنسبة لطلاب الدراسات العليا الليبيين، خاصة وأنهم تعلموا اللغة الإنجليزية كلغة أجنبية. وبناء على ما قلت سلفا قمت بتدريس الطلاب الترجمة باستعمال طريقة تعليق الترجمة. أثبتت هده الممارسة بأنها مثمرة في هده الحالة. هده الورقة البحثية هي عبارة عن تحليل خمسة عشر تعليقا على ترجمة من الإنجليزية إلى العربية لترجمة نص واحد. النص المترجم هو تعليق أدبي على قصيدة بعنوان: عروس المزارع للشاعرة الإنجليزية: شارلوت ميو والتي نشرت لأول مرة عام **1916**. وتصف الورقة البحثية أيضا تعليق الترجمة كأداة يستعملها طلاب الدراسات العليا للبحث قي عملية ترجمة النصوص الأدبية العربية إلى الإنجليزية. وتخلص الورقة إلى أن كتابة تعليق على الترجمة هي عملية تفاعلية لا تتضمن فقط محتوى ودلالات النص المصدر ولكن تتعداه إلى الجوانب الأخرى للنص بما فيها الخصائص اللغوية والصوتية والتصويرية التي تجعلها إبداعا أدبيا .

**KEYWORDS:** Translation Commentary (TC), Target Text (TT), Source Text (ST), Literary Translation, Evaluation

## Introduction

As an initial investigation, this research draws from 15 translation commentaries written by 15 MA students, translation major in Libya (spring 2022), 10 with above average level students, 5 average/below average students. Translation Commentaries (TCs) as an assessment/learning tools can be used with all levels of students. Students need to be trained to do TCs and they should improve as they keep writing them. Let's not forget that our students are foreign language learners, and writing their own TCs can be a big push to improve English language skills and of course Arabic language skills as students can be made to write Arabic commentaries on translating English texts into Arabic.

The students are at different stages of their MA programme. Some are in the 2nd semester, some in the 3rd semester, and some are doing their last taught courses and starting their dissertations soon. All of the students are girls, except one male student. Students worked in groups of 3/4 all the time to translate a text. When all the groups finish their tasks, they come back as a whole class for discussion/feedback of what problems/issues each group faced during the process of translating their text. This can be called an oral commentary and preparation/training for the written TCs. Then, the class moves to another cycle of the same. I only decided to go

for TCs business after the Midterm exam. I gave students three academic published papers on TCs writing that we read and discussed in the class. I, then, used TCs as an assessment tool in the final exam which you will see samples of later on in the paper. In the future, I will use less traditional assessment types: MCQs, EMCQs, T/F etc. and more of TCs.

## 2. Golden Rules of Translation

1. Be faithful to the source text (ST), it is a trust with you, so you keep the ST in good faith. Being honest is definitely a requirement for a translator/interpreter. A translator has to appear in front of a judge before getting licenced as a legal translator/interpreter.

2. To every speech, there is a context. Context can cover many things including the position of a word in a sentence, audience, setting, etc. Therefore, context must be considered and accounted for in translation.

3. There is always a room for improvement: i.e. improving the target text (TT). A text can be re-written several times to be improved as, of course, if time and other limitations allow. The more we read the ST the more we understand it. Go over your translation after you have finished it. Be flexible.

1. Be clear, no ambiguity allowed in translation. You do not want the reader of the TT to ask: What does this mean?

2. Be accurate, represent the ST accurately in terms of grammar, spelling, punctuation and paragraphing. These aspects are known as the mechanics of a text.

3. The translator must use cohesion and coherence to produce a consistent translated text.

4. The translator must create a truthful TT. He cannot camouflage or change what is written/said in the ST.

5. A translator should use any available technology.

There are free online websites: Google Translate, Almaany, Reverso and apps applications. There are also very expensive translation software, mostly used by international companies.

**3. Theoretical framework**

*Give a Man a Fish, and You Feed Him for a Day. Teach a Man To Fish, and You Feed Him for a Lifetime.*

This proverb says: Do not give a man a fish; but teach him how to fish.

Teaching a person, a useful skill can be more beneficial in the long run than filling a need for them temporarily, that's basically the meaning of this Chinese proverb.

In writing translation commentaries students are going through a learning experience of doing translation, applying principles, using strategies and reflection on their translation work. Hence, Kolb's experiential learning cycle can be used to underpin the creation of TCs. A TC (as an assessment tool) lends itself well to the theory of experiential learning cycle developed by Kolb. According to Kolb (2014: 51), "learning is the process whereby knowledge is created through the transformation of experience". Kolb's (2014: 31-49) experiential learning cycle is made of four phases, "concrete experience," "reflective observation," "abstract conceptualisation" and "active experimentation".

In other words, translation students learn by doing translation, reflecting on their translation, forming principles about translation, planning the next translation task and finally going full circle back to doing translation.

In Kelly's opinion (2005: 47), students may do the experiential learning cycles in different orders, so it is important to keep some form of flexibility in the curriculum design, so that different students' potential learning styles and cycles can be catered for. This flexibility is called "Differentiation" in language teaching.

She suggested the use of a translation portfolio as a type of flexible assessment method to facilitate this cycle. Interestingly, "commentaries on translation" was suggested by Kelly (2005: 139) to be an essential component of translation portfolios, even though she did not give much detail on this and she did not even define "commentaries on translation".

Nevertheless, what she said confirms the fact that a TC is commonly used as an assessment method attached to translating a piece of text.

When students are asked to write a TC or comment on their own translations, they are actually asked to learn translation not just by doing it, but by reflecting and possibly forming some insights about it so that they can improve their translation skills in the future.

## 1. What is a translation commentary?

One translation commentary definition by Chis Shei, 2005 is:

. . . a student composition required to accompany a translation task explaining the student's analysis of the text and the context, the problem-solving procedures, and other task-related thoughts.

Others call TCs:

''translation annotations'' (Adab, 2000), or ''translation diaries'' (Fox, 2000, Martinez and Hurtado, 2001), which can serve as an instrument for evaluation, a student consciousness-raising activity, or a basis for further instruction.

As we can see from these definitions that a TC is an academic writing task created by students for learning and assessment purposes. We can also see some differences in terminology, so TCs are also called translation annotations, translation diaries, commented on translations, and translation reports.

A translation commentary is a form of a piece of critical writing informed by the student's own literary translation into Arabic. (Warwick University Prospectus, 2019, UK.)

Again, this definition is more or less as the same as the first definition.

Galán-Mañas and Hurtado Albir define it as follows:

… a document in which students can identify problematic fragments they have encountered when translating a text, explain the process they have followed to resolve problems, specify the sources they have consulted and the time they have spent on the task, etc. (2015: 71).

Sewell suggested eight aims for TCs as an assessment method.

(1) to raise awareness of translation policy
(2) to promote [the] ability to reflect upon procedures which are often taken for granted
(3) to draw attention to the relationship between surface words and the underlying meaning (4) to raise the profile of cultural knowledge required by translators
(5) to focus attention on patterns of differences between SL and TL using the techniques of comparative stylistics
(6) to promote awareness of notions of textuality, such as cohesion and coherence
(7) intertextuality, i.e. to begin to do justice to a 'gigantic network of cross-references, echoes and illusions'
(8) to encourage reading of a theoretical nature to underpin the commentaries. (Sewell 2002: 17-23)

## 2. Student definitions of TCs

In her study the author: Yi-yi Shih C, (2018) University College London, asked a number of students to describe their experience of writing TCs. The following are several replies by the interviewees of what they think TCs are:

Translation commentary is a way for students to be assessed as to how they analyse ST by applying relevant theories and how they make relevant translation decisions.

Translation commentary is an opportunity for students to justify their translation product. They are given a chance to justify their translation. It does not matter whether their translation is good or bad, they are all given a chance to justify their translation.

Translation commentary is a way to distinguish between professional and unprofessional translators. Professional translators have to justify their decisions with the support of relevant theory. So, it is important for translators to equip themselves with theories in translation and to try to use these theories to inform their decisions and their practice.

Translation commentary is an essay about a piece of translation and about students' experience of translating this piece of work. One of the purposes is meant to be reflective. Students are reflecting on their process and gaining professional awareness.
. . . translation commentary should consist of two parts: The first part is about skopos, text types, background research and terminology research. The second part is about translation problems or challenges and their corresponding solutions. The first part is more theory-oriented and the second part is a kind of reflection.

Some key terms were frequently used by the interviewees to describe TCs in the above-mentioned study include: reflection, justification, choice, theory, translation product and process, translation problem and solution and being professional. A good TC should include all of these concepts.

A good translation commentary in general, should show that students have fully understood the theories used and can apply these theories when they are translating. Students should show awareness of their own strategies by being able to stand back and to accurately describe their own practice as if they are someone else who was observing. Students should be able to reflect on their translation and use the reflection to im-

prove their future translations. This will enable students to learn from their mistakes.

### 3. Student Translation Commentaries

| Para 1 | ST |
|---|---|
| | **Language:**<br>**"I chose a maid"-** shows a system of patriarchy, men over women. This suggests she didn't have any choice in the marriage and further shown in the title. She belongs to him. |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | This poem is about patriarchy and we can find out what is about from its title 'The Farmer's Wife' which made it clear that the man 'farmer' is superior than his wife. |
| S 2 | No commentary |
| S 3 | Cultural items translation: Patriarchy: الأبوية السلطة this term doesn't have the same effect that it has on the ST reader The TT reader may understand it in a positive way even though is negative |
| S 4 | Off topic answer |
| S 5 | General comments rather than a cohesive argument commentary |
| S 6 | The translator had to change many of Google wording like in the first line النظام الذكوري was chosen instead of النظام الأبوي |
| S 7 | Off topic |
| S 8 | No commentary |
| S 9 | General comment NO TC: The title of this poetry is the 'farmer's wife' talking about a farmer and his wife and their relationship together. he treated her in bad way that he owns her wanting her to obey him by serving him the way he wants. |
| S 10 | Even the begging of the the poet "I chose a maid." represent the bad relationship that the husband and his wife have, as he make her in a image like a maid." |
| S 11 | General comment NO TC |
| S 12 | General comment NO TC |
| S 13 | General comment NO TC |
| S 14 | General comment NO TC |

| | |
|---|---|
| S 15 | General comment NO TC |

| | |
|---|---|
| Para 2 | ST |
| | "We chased her flying like a hare": Hunting imagery suggests she is afraid and her terror |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | 'Flying like a hare' In Arabic people tend to use wolves "ذئاب" when it comes to a situation where a man is trying to 'haunt' a woman. |
| S 2 | No TC |
| S 3 | No TC |
| S 4 | Off topic |
| S 5 | There is also a simile 'we chased he like flying hare but here the use of hare to meet the rhyme of scare because hare cannot fly. |
| S 6 | However, the translator sticked to Google's choice in the fourth line تطير وهي although it was literal but conveys the meaning of how much she suffers that she ran away 'flying'. |
| S 7 | Off topic |
| S 8 | No TC |
| S 9 | Translated as "جريا تسرع الأرنب مثل طاردناها" ؤ" changing the order of words to make rhyme. |
| S 10 | No TC |
| S 11 | One of the challenges is how to translate 'Flying like a hare' which means بسرعة تهرب |
| S 12 | No TC |
| S 13 | No TC |
| S 14 | No TC |
| S 15 | No TC |

| | |
|---|---|
| Para 3 | ST |
| | "All in a shiver and a scare": Her fear is expressed physically like a hunted animal. "scare" rhymes with "hare" which emphasizes the comparison |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | Same thing in the following verse where I choose to أوصالها ترتعش وترتعد to show how afraid is she while a replaced haunted animal with فريسة because he is her husband now and no longer chasing her, it means that she is within his complete reach so know she is a 'prey'. |
| S 2 | No TC |
| S 3 | Hare, scare are words that rhyme but the translation Do not rhyme as a way to compensate (والخوف الأرنب) Diactrical marks were added to reasamble the sound |
| S 4 | Off topic |
| S 5 | There is no rhyme أرنب خائفة so I have to made it transliteration. |
| S 6 | No TC |
| S 7 | Off topic |
| S 8 | Translating poetry is no easy task by any means, so it did pose quite the challenge in making rhyming words in ST also rhyme in TT. I feel I was able to do that with most verses like "أرنب" and "خوف" where I made both end with the sound /i:/ as well as the passives "احتجزت" and "قفلت" |
| S 9 | No TC |
| S 10 | No TC |
| S 11 | No TC |
| S 12 | No TC |
| S 13 | No Tc |
| S 14 | No TC |
| S 15 | No TC |

| | |
|---|---|
| Para 4 | ST |
| | **"Home at last, key upon her fast":** Rhyming couplet shows decisive action of locking her away and makes it sound more sinister |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | The next verse he made it as home a ward for her or more as a salvation that he offered he out of charity and she only has to be faithful to him and I add the word "فظاعة" to make it clear that situation was way more than bad |

| | |
|---|---|
| S 2 | For example, the rhyme was not considered whrn translating this verse “Home at last, key upon her fast” as we shall see later on. The word (fast) was mistranslated. Google translate was like (في النهاية في المنزل صيامها على مفتاح). Fast was translated as ( صيام) which is of course wrong. And this is the issue of google translate, dealing with denotative meaning and not considering the connotative aspect of a word. |
| S 3 | No TC |
| S 4 | Off topic |
| S 5 | No TC |
| S 6 | No TC |
| S 7 | Off topic |
| S 8 | No TC |
| S 9 | No TC |
| S 10 | No TC |
| S 11 | No TC |
| S 12 | No TC |
| S 13 | No TC |
| S 14 | No TC |
| S 15 | Some lines of poem are ambiguous that requires alot of time and search to get the right meaning to translate it such as (key upon her fast) I do my best to do best translation. but I think It has implied meaning. |

| | |
|---|---|
| Para 5 | ST |
| | **“Happy enough to chat to birds and rabbits”:** She only talks to animals suggesting mental instability and depression |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | The following verse I deleted “enough “were it won’t fit the Arabic translation and ruin it. Here the poet made a clever choiceto call her nuts without really saying it which made it difficult to transfer it with the same effect |
| S 2 | No TC |
| S 3 | No TC |
| S 4 | Off topic |

| | |
|---|---|
| S 5 | No TC |
| S 6 | No TC |
| S 7 | Off topic |
| S 8 | No TC |
| S 9 | No TC |
| S 10 | he explained throughout the Allegory of ‘bird’ and rabbits’ as an example of animals that his wife prefer to talk more than her husband. No TC |
| S 11 | No TC |
| S 12 | No TC |
| S 13 | The husband feels that he is better then his wife who loved the house birds and rabbits more than him. |
| S 14 | No TC |
| S 15 | No TC |

| | |
|---|---|
| Para 6 | ST |
| | **“Beasts in stall, Look round like children at her call, *I’ve* hardly seen her speak at all”** Powerful line suggests animals are willing to be looked after by her so the farmer is possibly jealous. He hasn’t heard her speak which shows how far apart they are. The way the “I’ve” is in italics show how he thinks of himself as more important and feels the need for his opinion to be spoken and heard above all. The rhyming triplet emphasizes frustration. |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | Beasts here refers to animals, I found it was out jealousy as it would be clear later, that’s why he chose to mention them as Beasts rather than animals. While I completely changed the following sentence for reasons and making it compitable with poem [look around like children in her call] نادت كلما نداءها تلبي<br>Which presented the exact same meaning which is obedience.<br>I had to write the word “I’ve” as it is then translate it to make it clear to the reader of the commentary because the translation alone won’t clarify it enough |
| S 2, 3 | No TC |

| | |
|---|---|
| S 4 | Off topic |
| S 5 | No TC |
| S 6 | Moreover, the translator had difficulties time translating the line 12, as “stall” has many meanings and Google Translate did not help in this. However, “stall” was render as “ المربط”. Add to this, the third verse in this line was played with by the translator to be “الإطلاق على تحدثني لم وأنا” |
| S 7 | Off topic |
| S 8 | In in another case I used the possessive suffix “هم” to rhyme “beasts in stall, look round like children at her call” as إمرتهم وهي أطفال وكأنهم تتفقدهم إسطبلهم في والحيوانات |
| S 9 | She started a relationship and became friedly to animals more than her husband that’s when he started to jelouse and breaking down because of her refusal for him. |
| Ss 10, 11,12, | No TC |
| S 13 | No TC |
| S 14 | No TC |
| S 15 | No TC |

| | |
|---|---|
| Para 7 | ST |
| | “Shy as a leveret” shows she is still being hunted |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | Shy as a levert – I was torn about between translating it as “خجولة كالنرجس” or "كالأرنب وديعة” I chose the second one because of the commentary next to it to make sense. |
| S 2 | No TC |
| S 3 | “Shy as a levert” google translation did not translate this part. the translator had to find an equivalent of Leveret صغير ... الخرنق الأرنب |
| S 4 | Off topic |
| S 5 | No TC |
| S 6 | No TC |
| S 7 | Off topic |
| S 8 | No TC |

| | |
|---|---|
| S 9 | No TC |
| S 10 | No TC |
| S 11 | No TC |
| S 12 | No TC |
| S 13 | No TC |
| S 14 | “The line Shy as a leveret” in google it is (كالرافعة خجولة) while leveret means (small hare). |
| S 15 | No TC |

| | |
|---|---|
| Para 8 | ST |
| | “S..Swift…Straight…Sweet…She” constant use of sibilance shows a link with nature. Irregularity in stanza shows frustration with his desire not being fulfilled. |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | In this verse he started all the adjectives with S to fit the word She which starts with the same letter as well. It was impossible to find words that start with S in Arabic to describe her so I made the rhyming at the end “مربوطة تاء”.<br>I faced a real problem with translating Sibilance which is like rhyming but it starts with the first letteres rather than the last and replaced “س” with “تاء” because it won’t make any sense when I words I chose doesn't have that letter. |
| S 2 | The use of (Sibilance) indicates an important effect and impact, and it was lost when translating the sentence throughout google:<br>S, swift . . . straight . . . sweet . . . She eas translated as<br>هي حلوة، مستقيمة، سريعة،<br>A part of the effect of the verse was lost, in my translation I tried to gather words of same letters<br>الجمال سكرية سوية، سريعة، |
| S 3 | No TC, S 4, S 7 Off topic |
| S 5 | When I came across Sibilance “S . . sweft, sweet, straight she if with translation the She at their end /S/ sound will have different letter in Arabic. |
| S 6 | In line 20, there was a use of Sibilance in the ST; thus, the trans- |

| | |
|---|---|
| | lator saw a need to render this figure of speech in the TL and so the word "سمحة" was used as an equivalent to "sweet". |
| S 8 | Work out with one case, thus I had to use transliteration since it has a phonetic significance as well as including their meaning between brackets so as the reader wouldn't feel a complete loss of meaning. |
| S 9 | Rhythm is related to the matching number of syllabus in each line and finding meaningful words that fit in terms of rhythm and rhyme is a problem facing translators such as in line "S. . . Swift . . . straight . . . sweet . . she" translated "لطيف سمح سوي سريع" is much more appropriate but this line is about repeating the wisles of "S" |
| S 10, | S 11, S 12, S 15 No TC |
| *S 13* | *There is some problems in the poem translating. When I tried to render the line number "8" I could not found a way to translate itbecause the line's sibilance is with the letter 'S' and if I translated the words: swift, straight, and sweet, the first letters of the Arabic equivalences will not be 'S' 'حلو' , 'مستقيم' وسريع* |
| *S 14* | *With comparing to google translation some words need to be translated (phonetically) literally because the writer mean the sound not the exact menaing like the line (S. . .* |

| Para 9 | ST |
|---|---|
| | **"What's Christmas time… Some other in the house than we**!" Christmas is about the birth of a child but they have no kids because of her refusal |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | Next, he is complaining for not having kids. |
| S 2 | No TC |
| S 3 | No TC |
| S 4 | Off topic |
| S 5 | No TC |
| S 6 | Off topic |
| S 7 | No TC |
| S 8 | No TC |
| S 9 | Understanding the poetry alone was hard but after reading the |

| | |
|---|---|
| | commentary after it, it made it much more clear. Such as in "What's christmas time . . . Some other in the house than we" |
| S 10 | In the part "What christmas tim . . . "<br>the writer her used the conotation of imaging the kids that the writer mean, so the speech was not written but was able to understand that he talk about the number of family members "children" |
| S 11 | . . . One of the ambuguise mesning of (christmas time) it is a metaphore of giving birth. |
| S 12 | No TC |
| S 13 | No TC |
| S 14 | No TC |
| S 15 | No TC |

| Para 10 | ST |
|---|---|
| | **"her hair, her hair, her hair!"** constant repetition shows he's breaking down |

Student Translation Commentaries (TC)

| | |
|---|---|
| S 1 | The last verse was of him admiring her beauty an there are no better ways to translate than "آه, رباه" to show his truly break down. |
| S 2 | In the verse "her hair, her hair, her hair" I added the word (يا إلهي) to add more emphasis to his feelings. |
| S 3 | No TC |
| S 4 | Off topic |
| S 5 | No TC |
| S 6 | No TC |
| S 7 | Off topic |
| S 8 | No TC |
| S 9 | No TC |
| S 10 | No TC |
| S 11 | No TC |
| S 12 | No TC |
| S 13 | No Tc |

| | |
|---|---|
| S 14 | No TC |
| S 15 | No TC |

**4. Student notes on Translation Commentaries**

What are my students are saying on their experience of writing TCs?

S 5. Finally I enjoyed more with (the commentary than with poem because I'm not interested in literature and it was very challenging to translate rhythm

S 8. As far its commentary translation, it was pretty clear and direct, so there wasn't much difficulty encountered. The dictionary was used with individual words to select the most appropriate translation.

All in all, it was quite fun getting creative in this sort of poetry translation despite the challenges.

S 11. Generally, the text was easy to deal with and I really enjoyed translating it with its story meaning. To conclude, I was familiar with the most of the text, the only barries are the poetic words.

S 12. In fact, Google helps me in translating only the meaning of the words, but what these words mean through the poem, this is belong to the translator's creativity.

I think it is a good experiment for me to translate it and hope Allah get me the good luck

S. 13 The poem is good it has a good objective which is respecting our women. my attempt to translate this poem's analysis is a pleasure, I really did enjoyed it.

S 15. Translating this text was full of benefits for me as a translator. I get a background about analysing poems and lernt about English literature.

As we can see, there is a wide range of opinions, and most importantly, students enjoyed writing commentaries where they have to make deci-

sions on what is the best equivalent to express the sours text meaning and defending their decisions.

Yi-yi Shih C, (2018) provides the following assessment criteria:

| Categories of marking criteria | Marking criteria |
|---|---|
| Essay related criteria | Clarity and consistency |
| | Critical analytic ability |
| | Acknowledgement of references |
| | Use of theories/reading |
| Translation commentary-specific criteria | Analysis on ST intention and TT reader-ship |
| | Sensitivity of cultural transfer |
| | Ability to justify solutions to problems |
| | Awareness/consideration of problems |
| | Formation of overall translation strategy |
| | Specific translation strategy |

Table 3: Summary of marking criteria, Yi-yi Shih C, (2018)

Personally, I have adapted the simpler IELTS criteria for assessing student TCs:

1. **Translation task fulfilment**

Students are expected to answer the question fully covering all aspects of translation related to a particular text: theoretical and practical. If they don't, they get an Off Topic note and zero mark.

2. Cohesion and coherence

Students must show that they understand and can use Arabic/English cohesive devices accurately and be coherent in their writing. Misuse of cohesion and coherence can lead to a bad TT.

3. Observing the mechanics of the TT

Students must make sure that TT is free from any spelling, grammatical, and punctuation errors.

4. Use a range of vocabulary

This will improve the quality of the TT by making it more interesting and less boring especially when translating literary works. It will make it an academic text and hence professionally written.

## 5. Conclusion

This study set out to investigate defining TCs, and their value as an assessment/learning tool at the Libyan Academy.

A TC is recognised as a reflective report where students have to make decisions and justify their translation choices for a particular translation task.

A TC is also recognised as an academic essay, where students are required to exercise critical reflection on the process of creating a piece of translation.

In terms of practice the term, translation commentary seems to be the preferred term among translation educators to describe this kind of assessment, when compared to "translation annotation".

It is very interesting to note that, despite the fact that a TC is an attachment to a piece of translation, it can also combine different kinds of assessments of understanding and skills that go beyond the translation itself. It can assess knowledge about translation scholarship and problem-

solving skills, background research skills, abilities to reflect, and awareness. A TC can work as a platform to combine all kinds of knowledge and skills. This shows that a TC is a truly valuable educational tool and explains why it is a common type of assessment method in many universities abroad as it provides trainee translators the scope to present their knowledge of translation theory and practice through reflection enabling them to become full-fledged professional translators.

This combining process sits right at the centre of Kolb's (2014) concept of experiential learning where learning occurs when experiences are transformed into knowledge. A TC as an assessment method is a flexible method that can be used in BA degrees, and as MA and PhD theses. The Journal of Specialised Translation Issue 30 – July 2018:309 is very important to emphasise here that a TC has two main characteristics: a good piece of academic writing and a selection of translation problems that really pose challenges to translators in a particular text.

The current research has looked into students produced TCs, further research can expand to look at translator educator perspectives and how TCs can be developed in the future to enhance translator training in Libya and in other countries. More research is also needed to investigate the link between assessment/marking criteria and the set aims of TCs in different educational contexts.

## References

Almanna, Ali (2016). The Routledge Course in Translation Annotation: Arabic-English/Arabic. London and New York: Routledge.

Baker, M. (1992). *In other words: A course book on translation*. London & New York: Routledge

Baker, M. and Saldanha, G., eds. 2011. *Routledge Encyclopaedia of Translation Studies.* 2nd ed. Abingdon: Routledge.

Kelly, Dorothy. (2005) A handbook of translation trainers. Manchester: St Jerome

Kolb, David, A. (1984) Experiential learning: Experience as the Source of learning & Development. Prentice Hall.

Sewell, Penelope, M. (2002) Translation commentary: The Art Revisited: A study of French Texts. Dublin: Philomel

Shei Chris, (2005). Translation commentary: A happy medium between translation and EAP. System.

Shuttleworth, M and Cowie, M., 1997. *Dictionary of Translation Studies.* Abingdon: Routledge.

Wales, K., 2011. *A Dictionary of Stylistics.* 3rd ed. Harlow: Longman.

Yi-yi Shih C, (2018) Translation commentary re-examined in the eyes of translator educators at British universities University College London